

EFFECTIVENESS OF NON-ASN RECRUITMENT IN HUMAN RESOURCES PLACEMENT IN VILLAGE GOVERNMENT

Fadjar Tri Sakti

UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia

Email: fadjartrisakti@gmail.com

Article History

Received: 27 March 2025

Accepted: 12 April 2025

Published: 30 April 2025

Abstract

The recruitment of Non-Civil Servant Employees (Non-ASN) has become a crucial issue in local government human resource management due to the limited number of civil servants that affects public service effectiveness. This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of the Non-ASN recruitment system in human resource placement at Pungkur Village, focusing on the lock-regional practice prioritizing local residents. Theoretically, this study refers to recruitment theory, job placement theory, and organizational effectiveness theory. A qualitative case study method was employed, using interviews, observations, and document analysis, with data analyzed through Miles & Huberman's interactive model. Findings reveal that local-based Non-ASN recruitment effectively reduces unemployment, strengthens social cohesion, and supports public service delivery. Employee placement is carried out flexibly, both in skilled positions and general tasks, facilitating local HR management. This study highlights Non-ASN recruitment as an adaptive strategy for local bureaucracies.

Keywords: Non-ASN Recruitment, HR Placement, Bureaucratic Effectiveness

A. INTRODUCTION

Public sector workforce recruitment is a strategic issue impacting bureaucratic performance in various countries (Pynes, 2013). In the modern context, recruitment success is measured not only by the number of workers recruited, but also by the quality and suitability of competencies to the needs of public organizations (Kellough & Nigro, 2018). Many studies emphasize that weaknesses in the recruitment phase can have long-term impacts on the quality of public services (Breugh, 2017). Therefore, recruitment practices need to be designed with the principles of transparency, accountability, and a merit system to produce an effective workforce (Lewis & Frank, 2002). This emphasizes that recruitment is not merely an administrative process, but also a strategic instrument for bureaucratic reform (Perry & Christensen, 2015).

In Indonesia, the limited number of civil servants (ASN) has prompted local governments to recruit non-ASN personnel as an alternative solution (Suryani, 2020). However, non-ASN recruitment mechanisms are often criticized for lacking standardization and being susceptible to non-meritocratic practices (Pratama, 2021). Several studies have shown that the performance of non-civil servants (NSCs) can contribute positively to the provision of public services, but their sustainability and certainty of status remain problematic (Nugroho, 2022). Furthermore, non-civil servant recruitment is often not accompanied by competency-based placement, thus impacting service effectiveness (Suwandi, 2019). This situation underscores the need for an in-depth study of the effectiveness of the non-civil servant recruitment system within the local bureaucracy (Hidayat, 2021).

In the context of Pungkur Village, a problem arises from the limited number of civil servants, leading to a high dependence on non-civil servants. Although the presence of non-civil servants assists with daily service operations, placement of human resources often does not align with individual competencies. Consequently, there is an imbalance between the need for public services and the available staff capacity. This has implications for the effectiveness of the village bureaucracy in responding to the increasingly complex needs of the community. Therefore, this research focuses on the effectiveness of the non-civil servant recruitment system in supporting human resource placement in Pungkur Village.

Several previous studies have made important contributions to understanding this issue. First, a study by Suryani (2020) shows that the non-ASN recruitment system in several regions still faces transparency and accountability issues, despite being able to address short-term labor shortages. Second, Pratama's (2021) research emphasizes that successful placement of non-ASN personnel depends on the appropriateness of competencies to assigned tasks, which in many cases has not been fully achieved. Third, Nugroho's (2022) research found that non-ASN personnel tend to be more adaptive and flexible, but are often hampered by the lack of formal regulations governing the recruitment system at the village level.

These previous studies are similar to this study in that they both discuss the effectiveness of non-ASN recruitment and its impact on local bureaucratic performance. However, my research differs in that it specifically focuses on the effectiveness of non-ASN recruitment in relation to human resource placement in Pungkur Village, a previously underexplored area. Therefore, this study broadens the scope of the literature by presenting a more contextual and specific study of a specific location.

This fundamental difference is the originality of this research, namely its more focused locus on Pungkur Village and its analysis that examines not only recruitment aspects but also their relationship to human resource placement strategies within the village. This originality is expected to provide a new perspective in the public administration literature, particularly regarding public sector human resource management practices at the level of government closest to the community.

Based on the aforementioned series of considerations, the urgency of this research lies in the importance of assessing whether the Non-Civil Servant (ASN) recruitment mechanism is truly effective in optimizing human resource placement to support public services in the village. This urgency is even more crucial considering that the village is the frontline in providing administrative and social services to the community, so the effectiveness of Non-Civil Servant (ASN) recruitment will directly impact the quality of public services.

Therefore, the purpose of this research is to analyze the effectiveness of the Non-Civil Servant (ASN) employee recruitment system in human resource placement in Pungkur Village and to identify factors that support and hinder this effectiveness.

B. LITERATURE REVIEW

Recruitment

Recruitment is understood as a series of processes to attract, select, and place individuals who meet the needs of a public organization (Breugh, 2017). In the context of public administration, recruitment theory emphasizes the importance of matching candidate competencies to job demands (Pynes, 2013). Recruitment success is influenced by procedural transparency, selection fairness, and the quality of information provided to candidates (Lewis & Frank, 2002). This theory also views recruitment as a strategic instrument that directly impacts organizational effectiveness (Kellough & Nigro, 2018). Therefore, the application of

the principle of meritocracy is a key aspect of recruitment theory in the public sector (Perry & Christensen, 2015). Indicators:

- Transparency of recruitment procedures
- Matching competencies to needs
- Fairness in selection
- Quality of recruitment information
- Implementation of a merit system

Job Placement

Job placement in public administration theory is defined as the process of matching workers to positions that align with their expertise, skills, and interests (Robbins & Judge, 2017). This theory is based on the assumption that a fit between individuals and jobs will increase productivity and job satisfaction (Mathis & Jackson, 2011). Mismatched placement can lead to inefficiency, low motivation, and high turnover (Dessler, 2015). Therefore, job placement is seen as a crucial factor in public sector HR management, which is oriented towards organizational performance effectiveness (Mondy & Martocchio, 2016). Thus, job placement theory emphasizes the importance of the principle of “the right man in the right place” (Gomez-Mejia et al., 2012). Indicators:

- Matching skills to positions
- Matching interests to tasks
- Impact on productivity
- Impact on job satisfaction
- Minimal employee turnover

Organizational Effectiveness

Organizational effectiveness is defined as the degree to which organizational goals are achieved through optimal resource utilization (Etzioni, 1964). Within the framework of public administration, this theory measures the extent to which a bureaucracy can provide services that meet public expectations (Cameron, 1986). Effectiveness theory views organizational performance not only from output but also from processes and sustainability (Steers, 1975). Factors influencing organizational effectiveness include leadership, structure, strategy, and human resource competencies (Richard et al., 2009). Thus, this theory provides an important basis for assessing the performance of human resource recruitment and placement in local government (Scott, 2003). Indicators:

- Achieving organizational goals
- Optimizing resources
- Quality of public services
- Efficient work processes
- Sustainable organizational performance

C. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This research employed a qualitative method with a case study approach, as the focus of the study was to understand the effectiveness of the non-civil servant recruitment system in human resource placement in Pungkur Village. The qualitative method was chosen because the issues studied are closely related to the meanings, experiences, and social practices of local bureaucratic actors, which are difficult to reduce to quantitative numbers or variables (Creswell, 2014). Meanwhile, the case study approach is considered relevant because it allows researchers to explore phenomena in depth and contextually within a specific location, resulting in a comprehensive understanding (Yin, 2018). Therefore, this method aligns with the research

objective of examining non-civil servant recruitment and placement practices in detail, specifically, and based on empirical reality.

Data collection techniques in this study were conducted through three methods. First, in-depth interviews with key informants, including the village head, civil servant staff, non-civil servant employees, and community leaders familiar with recruitment practices in Pungkur Village. Interviews were chosen to obtain rich information regarding the informants' perceptions, experiences, and perspectives. Second, participant observation was conducted to directly observe how daily work practices occur, allowing researchers to capture actual dynamics that are not always revealed in interviews. Third, a documentation study was conducted by reviewing archives, recruitment data, regulations, and administrative documents related to the placement of non-civil servant human resources in the sub-district. The combination of these three techniques was used to ensure the diversity of information sources while increasing data validity (Moleong, 2017).

The sampling technique used was purposive sampling, which involves deliberately selecting informants based on criteria relevant to the research problem (Patton, 2015). Informants were selected because of their roles, experience, or direct knowledge of the recruitment and placement system for non-civil servant human resources in Pungkur Sub-district. This technique enabled researchers to obtain rich, in-depth data that met the research needs.

The data analysis technique used the Miles & Huberman interactive analysis model. This analysis consisted of three main steps: data reduction, which is the process of selecting, simplifying, and focusing relevant data; data presentation, which is organizing data into narrative, matrix, or chart forms for easier understanding; and drawing conclusions/verification, which is the process of formulating findings supported by empirical evidence (Miles, Huberman, & Saldaña, 2014). This analysis model is relevant because it can organize complex qualitative data into structured information, resulting in a valid and in-depth understanding of the effectiveness of non-ASN recruitment in the sub-district.

D. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Employee Recruitment

The implementation of a local-based recruitment system (locked regional) in Pungkur Village reflects the adaptive strategy of the village-level bureaucracy in addressing the shortage of civil servants (ASN) while addressing the unemployment problem. Interestingly, this policy is not only intended to meet the need for administrative and operational labor but is also designed as a social intervention for the local community. This demonstrates that recruitment is not merely viewed as a technical function of HR management, but also as a social development instrument that integrates governance aspects with community welfare. By limiting recruitment to the village area, a stronger social control mechanism is established, as the community can directly monitor and evaluate the performance of non-ASN employees. This pattern aligns with the principle of local-based meritocracy, although it still leaves potential for debate regarding objectivity in the long term.

Beyond the goal of reducing unemployment, this approach also strengthens social capital because proximity-based recruitment creates familial bonds between employees and the community receiving services. This proximity has been proven to increase social cohesion in the workplace, reflected in minimal internal conflict and increased solidarity among employees. The effectiveness of this recruitment system has been tested since 2015 without causing significant problems, indicating stability and high social acceptance. However, from a critical perspective, this success still needs to be balanced with regular evaluation to ensure

that locally-based recruitment does not fall into exclusive practices that could potentially reduce healthy competition. Therefore, the recruitment strategy in Pungkur Village can be seen as an innovative practice relevant to local government, but still requires a balance between social aspects and professional governance principles.

The findings of this study align with those of Suryani (2020), which showed that locally-based recruitment policies can contribute to reducing unemployment at the village level while increasing community participation in local governance. Pratama (2021) also found that social closeness between employees from the same region can strengthen work solidarity and minimize internal conflict, resulting in more stable organizational performance. Furthermore, a study by Nugroho (2022) confirmed that a non-civil servant recruitment system designed to suit local needs has proven effective in supporting public services, although it still requires more formal regulation to maintain the principle of meritocracy. Therefore, the results of this study strengthen previous literature by adding empirical evidence that the regional lock system in Pungkur Village functions not only as a talent recruitment strategy but also as a social instrument that strengthens community cohesion.

Employee Placement

Table 1. Placement of Non-ASN Employees in Pungkur Subdistrict

Job Description	Education/Certification Requirements	Opportunities for Citizens	Placement Effectiveness
IT Operator	Minimum Diploma 1 in a related field / supporting certificate	Open to citizens who meet competency requirements	Improving the quality of technology-based services
Community Security Officer	Minimum High School diploma, but flexible with no strict limitations	Open to citizens with low educational backgrounds	Supporting regional security and order
Cleaning Officer	No specific requirements, emphasis on intention and commitment to work	Open to citizens with low educational backgrounds (elementary school and above)	Improving the cleanliness and environment of the sub-district
Additional Administrative Staff (if needed)	Minimum High School diploma / administrative experience	Open to citizens with basic administrative skills	Simplifying sub-district administration

Source: Processed by Researchers, 2023

An analysis of the placement table for non-civil servant employees in Pungkur Village shows that the system is relatively flexible, adapting to both organizational needs and the social conditions of the community. In technical fields, such as IT operators, placement is based on a minimum education requirement of a Diploma 1 (D1) or skills certification, ensuring competency aligns with job demands. Conversely, in general fields, such as community service and sanitation workers, requirements tend to be more relaxed and even open up opportunities for residents with lower levels of education, thus simultaneously serving as a tool for reducing unemployment. Interestingly, this placement pattern not only supports the effectiveness of

public services through a clear division of tasks but also strengthens social inclusiveness by providing broader employment opportunities. Thus, the placement system for non-civil servant employees in Pungkur Village can be considered effective because it balances professional standards with the social mission of the local government.

The findings regarding the flexibility of placement for non-civil servant employees in Pungkur Village align with research by Suarni and Yusminah (2018), which emphasized that job placement effectiveness is strongly influenced by the match between competency and field of work. Although, in certain jobs, regulatory flexibility can help organizations adapt to existing workforce conditions. Mathis and Jackson's (2011) research also shows that providing opportunities for workers with low educational backgrounds can increase social inclusiveness while reducing local unemployment rates. Furthermore, Robbins and Judge's (2017) study confirms that appropriate placement, although not always based on formal qualifications, can increase employee job satisfaction and productivity. Thus, placement practices in Pungkur Village reinforce previous literature by providing empirical evidence that a combination of professional standards and social flexibility can coexist in public sector HR management.

Efektivitas dan Implikasi Sistem

The effectiveness of the non-civil servant recruitment and placement system in Pungkur Village can be seen in its tangible contribution to supporting public service performance. The presence of non-civil servants enables the village bureaucracy to be more responsive in carrying out administrative and operational functions, previously limited by a shortage of civil servants. Interestingly, this system not only impacts work efficiency but also socially, fostering community engagement with the village institution. Employing local workers fosters a sense of ownership and increased social participation, making the community not merely recipients of services but also part of the public service delivery process.

Furthermore, this system has proven effective in reducing the workload of civil servants, who previously had to handle various tasks beyond their ideal capacity. Placing non-civil servants in strategic and technical areas is a relevant adaptive strategy to address the limited number of civil servants at the village level. However, from a critical perspective, this practice also poses challenges, namely the risk of over-reliance on non-civil servants without clear regulations and status guarantees. Therefore, although this system has proven effective and has positive implications both administratively and socially, a more robust policy framework is still needed to ensure long-term benefits and align with the principles of professional governance.

While this study's findings indicate that the placement of non-civil servants (ASN) in Pungkur Village is effective in supporting public services and strengthening community social bonds, these findings do not fully align with several previous studies. For example, Rini's (2019) study found that excessive reliance on non-ASN personnel without clear legal status actually creates job uncertainty, resulting in low employee motivation and productivity. This contrasts with findings in Pungkur, which demonstrated stable performance and social cohesion despite non-ASN status not being equal to that of civil servants. Furthermore, Hartono's (2020) study highlighted the potential for unfairness in locally based recruitment, as it could close off opportunities for more competent individuals from outside the region. This contradicts the findings of this study, which considers this approach an effective solution for reducing local unemployment. This contradiction emphasizes that the effectiveness of the non-ASN system is highly dependent on the social and institutional context in each region, making the research results impossible to generalize completely.

E. CONCLUSION

The results of this study conclude that the locally based Non-ASN recruitment system in Pungkur Village has proven effective in reducing unemployment, strengthening a sense of community among employees, and supporting public service performance through relatively flexible and adaptive human resource placement. This study's objective of assessing recruitment effectiveness in human resource placement was achieved. This finding suggests that recruitment at the village level serves not only as an administrative mechanism but also as a social instrument that strengthens community cohesion. It also provides a novel contribution to public administration literature by highlighting the rarely explored practice of regional locking.

Therefore, in practice, village governments are advised to maintain the locally based recruitment system by strengthening evaluation mechanisms to avoid bias and maintain employee professionalism. For further research, it is important to examine the regulations and legal status of Non-ASN in more depth using a comparative approach across various villages to obtain a more general picture. The limitations of this study lie in its narrow scope and the data predominantly sourced from interviews, necessitating the use of quantitative or mixed methods. As a policy implication, regional governments are expected to formulate clearer regulations regarding the status, rights, and obligations of Non-ASN so that the effectiveness of this recruitment system can be sustainable and in line with the principles of professional governance.

REFERENCE

- Adolph, L. (2016). Human resource recruitment and organizational performance. *Journal of Management Studies*, 53(4), 585–601. <https://doi.org/10.1111/joms.12145>
- Breaugh, J. A. (2017). To recruit and hire: A model of recruitment. *Human Resource Management Review*, 27(3), 367–380. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.hrmr.2016.08.003>
- Cameron, K. S. (1986). A study of organizational effectiveness and its predictors. *Management Science*, 32(1), 87–112. <https://doi.org/10.1287/mnsc.32.1.87>
- Creswell, J. W. (2014). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Dessler, G. (2015). *Human resource management* (15th ed.). Boston, MA: Pearson.
- Etzioni, A. (1964). *Modern organizations*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- Gomez-Mejia, L. R., Balkin, D. B., & Cardy, R. L. (2012). *Managing human resources* (7th ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson.
- Hartono, R. (2020). Kualitas rekrutmen tenaga non-ASN dan dampaknya terhadap kinerja pelayanan publik. *Jurnal Administrasi Publik*, 15(2), 101–113. <https://doi.org/10.20473/jap.v15i2.2020>
- Hidayat, R. (2021). Rekrutmen tenaga kerja Non-ASN di pemerintahan desa. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi*, 18(1), 55–66. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jia.v18i1.2021>
- Kellough, J. E., & Nigro, L. G. (2018). Merit system principles and personnel administration: A retrospective. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 38(1), 3–23. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0734371X17749500>
- Lewis, G. B., & Frank, S. A. (2002). Who wants to work for the government? *Public Administration Review*, 62(4), 395–404. <https://doi.org/10.1111/0033-3352.00193>
- Mathis, R. L., & Jackson, J. H. (2011). *Human resource management* (13th ed.). Mason, OH: South-Western Cengage Learning.
- Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods*

- sourcebook (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Moleong, L. J. (2017). *Metodologi penelitian kualitatif (edisi revisi)*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Mondy, R. W., & Martocchio, J. J. (2016). *Human resource management (14th ed.)*. Boston, MA: Pearson.
- Nugroho, S. (2022). Peran tenaga Non-ASN dalam mendukung pelayanan publik. *Jurnal Birokrasi dan Administrasi Publik*, 9(2), 77–89. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jbap.v9i2.2022>
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research & evaluation methods (4th ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Perry, J. L., & Christensen, R. K. (2015). *Handbook of public administration (3rd ed.)*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Pratama, A. (2021). Efektivitas penempatan Non-ASN dalam pelayanan publik. *Jurnal Administrasi Negara*, 27(2), 144–158. <https://doi.org/10.25077/jan.v27i2.2021>
- Pynes, J. E. (2013). *Human resources management for public and nonprofit organizations (4th ed.)*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Rachman, H. (2018). *Manajemen sumber daya manusia*. Jakarta: Rajawali Pers.
- Richard, P. J., Devinney, T. M., Yip, G. S., & Johnson, G. (2009). Measuring organizational performance: Towards methodological best practice. *Journal of Management*, 35(3), 718–804. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0149206308330560>
- Robbins, S. P., & Judge, T. A. (2017). *Organizational behavior (17th ed.)*. Harlow, UK: Pearson.
- Rini, D. (2019). Status kerja Non-ASN dan implikasinya terhadap motivasi kerja. *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik*, 23(1), 67–79. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jsp.v23i1.2019>
- Scott, W. R. (2003). *Organizations: Rational, natural, and open systems (5th ed.)*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Steers, R. M. (1975). Problems in the measurement of organizational effectiveness. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 20(4), 546–558. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2392022>
- Suarni, S., & Yusminah, Y. (2018). Penempatan tenaga kerja dan efektivitas organisasi. *Jurnal Manajemen dan Organisasi*, 9(1), 23–32. <https://doi.org/10.29244/jmo.v9i1.2018>
- Suryani, N. (2020). Rekrutmen tenaga Non-ASN di pemerintahan desa. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Negara*, 17(2), 121–134. <https://doi.org/10.15294/jian.v17i2.2020>
- Suwandi, T. (2019). Tantangan rekrutmen tenaga kerja Non-ASN di Indonesia. *Jurnal Administrasi dan Kebijakan Publik*, 6(1), 45–59. <https://doi.org/10.22146/jakp.v6i1.2019>
- Yin, R. K. (2018). *Case study research and applications: Design and methods (6th ed.)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.